ARTICLES

XH_4^{2+} Dications and Search for XH_4^{3+} Trications (X = N, P, and As)[†]

Golam Rasul,* G. K. Surya Prakash, and George A. Olah*

Donald P. and Katherine B. Loker Hydrocarbon Research Institute and Department of Chemistry, University of Southern California, University Park, Los Angeles, California 90089-1661

Received: February 2, 1998; In Final Form: March 16, 1998

Structures and energies of XH_4^{2+} and XH_4^{3+} (X = N, P, and As) were calculated at the ab initio MP2/6-31G** and QCISD(T)/6-311G** levels of theory. Contrary to previous theoretical studies, the global minimum structure of PH_4^{2+} is not C_{3v} symmetrical **2** but a C_s symmetrical **3** with a 2e-3c bond. The structure **2** is less stable than **3** by 6.5 kcal/mol. Calculations also showed that **2** if formed will spontaneously convert into **3**. The planar C_{2v} symmetric structure **6**, with a 3c-2e bond, was found to be the only minimum for PH_4^{3+} . Similarly, C_s symmetrical **8** and planar C_{2v} symmetric **10**, each containing a 2e-3c bond, were found to be the global minima of AsH_4^{2+} and AsH_4^{3+} , respectively. Thermodynamics of the deprotonation of the di- and trications studied is also discussed.

Introduction

Onium dications are of increasing significance both in gas phase^{2a} and in solution chemistry.^{2b} Consequently, knowledge of the structures and bondings of such highly electron-deficient dications are of great importance. The ammonium dication, NH_4^{2+} , is isoelectronic with the methane cation, CH_4^+ . But unlike CH_4^+ which is of $C_{2\nu}$ symmetry with a two electron three center (2e-3c) bond,³ the ab initio calculated structure of NH₄²⁺ is of D_{2d} symmetry with no 2e-3c interaction as shown by Koch and Schwarz⁴ and Pope et al.⁵ On the other hand, the calculated structure of PH_4^{2+} is of $C_{3\nu}$ symmetry with a 1e-2c bonding interaction and can be considered as a complex between PH3²⁺ and hydrogen radical (H•) as shown by Pope et al.⁵ The D_{2d} symmetrical structure of PH₄²⁺ was found not to be a minimum.^{5b} In the gas phase, charge-stripping mass spectrometric study showed that the vertical ionization of the precursor NH₄⁺ led to a state⁶ which is energetically higher than the transition state of deprotonation.⁴ No experimental work on PH₄²⁺ has yet been reported.



We report now based on ab initio calculations that the global minimum structure of PH_4^{2+} is not of $C_{3\nu}$ symmetry but of C_s symmetry with a 2e-3c bond. Ab inito method is particularly important to calculate such highly electron deficient species.^{2a} The $C_{3\nu}$ structure, although a minimum on the potential energy surface (PES), is significantly less stable than the C_s structure. Similar results were also found for AsH_4^{2+} . In addition, we also report the structures of trications PH_4^{3+} and AsH_4^{3+} , which



Figure 1. MP2/6-31G** structures of 1-6 (QCISD(T)/6-311G**).

can be derived by removing an electron from PH_4^{2+} and AsH_4^{2+} , respectively.

Methods

The geometry optimizations and frequency calculations were performed at the ab initio MP2/6-31G** level.⁷ From calculated frequencies, the optimized structures were characterized as minima (NIMAG = 0) or transition structures (NIMAG = 1). For the MP2/6-31G** optimized structures further geometry optimizations were carried out at the QCISD(T)/6-311G** level. For improved energy, single point energies at the CCSD(T)/cc-pVTZ⁸ level on QCISD(T)/6-311G** optimized geometries were computed. For the nitrogen and phosphorus compounds, final energies were calculated at the CCSD(T)/cc-pVTZ//QCISD(T)/6-311G** + ZPE level and for the arsenic compounds at the QCISD(T)/6-311G** + ZPE level. Calculated energies are given in Table 1. Calculations were carried out with the Gaussian 94⁹ and Spartan¹⁰ programs.

[†] Dedicated to Sydney Benson on the occasion of his 80th birthday.

 TABLE 1:
 Total Energies (-au), ZPE^a (kcal/mol)

MP2/6-31G**//MP2/6-31G**	QCISD(T)/6-311G**//QCISD(T)/6-311G**	CCSD(T)/cc-pVTZ//QCISD(T)/6-311G**
55.841 53 (21.5)	55.886 08	55.920 47
342.126 82 (16.6)	342.192 36	342.230 30
342.141 16 (18.3)	342.207 47	342.243 40
342.124 44 (15.9)	342.191 18	342.229 32
342.102 19 (15.1)	342.159 11	342.199 26
341.177 33 (14.1)	341.245 32	341.278 04
2233.408 77 (15.7)	2235.617 42	
2233.427 36 (16.8)	2235.642 72	
2233.402 35 (14.4)	2235.614 79	
2232.504 75 (13.1)	2234.723 69	
341.577 72 (13.9)	341.634 23	341.665 42
2232.863 53 (13.0)	2235.069 78	
	MP2/6-31G**//MP2/6-31G** 55.841 53 (21.5) 342.126 82 (16.6) 342.141 16 (18.3) 342.124 44 (15.9) 342.102 19 (15.1) 341.177 33 (14.1) 2233.408 77 (15.7) 2233.427 36 (16.8) 2233.402 35 (14.4) 2232.504 75 (13.1) 341.577 72 (13.9) 2232.863 53 (13.0)	MP2/6-31G**//MP2/6-31G** QCISD(T)/6-311G**//QCISD(T)/6-311G** 55.841 53 (21.5) 55.886 08 342.126 82 (16.6) 342.192 36 342.124 44 (15.9) 342.207 47 342.124 44 (15.9) 342.191 18 342.102 19 (15.1) 342.159 11 341.177 33 (14.1) 341.245 32 2233.408 77 (15.7) 2235.617 42 2233.402 35 (14.4) 2235.642 72 2233.402 35 (14.4) 2235.614 79 2232.504 75 (13.1) 2234.723 69 341.577 72 (13.9) 341.634 23 2232.863 53 (13.0) 2235.069 78

^a Zero point vibrational energies (ZPE) at MP2/6-31G**//MP2/6-31G** scaled by a factor of 0.93.

TABLE 2: ΔH_0 of Deprotonation (in kcal/mol)^a

ΔH_0
-117.7
-67.2
-60.7
-243.3
-41.3^{b}
-217.1^{b}

 a At the CCSD(T)/cc-pVTZ//QCISD(T)/6-311G** + ZPE level. b QCISD(T)/6-311G**//QCISD(T)/6-311G** + ZPE.

Results and Discussion

NH₄²⁺. Koch and Schwarz⁴ and Pope et al.⁵ have previously reported structures and energies NH₄²⁺. We have calculated the structure of the dication only for comparison with the PH₅²⁺ and AsH₅²⁺. Similar to the reported results, the D_{2d} symmetrical structure **1** is found to be the only minimum on the potential energy surface of NH₄²⁺ at both the MP2/6-31G** and QCISD (T)/6-311G** levels (Figure 1). The N–H bond distance of 1.119 Å and H₁NH₃ angle of 147.7° of **1** at the QCISD (T)/6-311G** level agree very well with the reported values of 1.126 Å and 146.2° (at the CASSCF/TZP level)^{5b} and 1.113 Å and 147.7° (at the MP2(FULL)/6-31G** level),⁴ respectively. Dissociation of **1** into NH₃⁺ and H⁺ is exothermic by 117.7 kcal/mol and the process has a 6.6 kcal/mol barrier (Table 2), very close to the reported values of 1.16.5 and 7.8 kcal/mol, respectively.⁴

The possible structure **1b** with a 3c-2e bond was not a minimum and collapsed to **1** upon optimization at the MP2/6-31G** and QCISD (T)/6-311G** levels without any activation barrier.



The adiabatic ionization energy (IE_a) of NH_4^+ was calculated (Table 3). The calculated IE_a of NH_4^+ was 24.0 eV compared with the experimental ionization energy of 24.5 eV.⁶

 $\rm NH_4^{3+}$. We also searched for any minimum-energy structure of $\rm NH_4^{3+}$. At the MP2/6-31G** or QCISD (T)/6-311G** level no structure of $\rm NH_4^{3+}$ on its potential energy surface could be found as a minimum. Charge–charge repulsion in $\rm NH_4^{3+}$ seems to have reached its prohibitive limit.

PH₄²⁺. Unlike NH₄²⁺, the C_{3v} structure **2** and the C_s structure **3** (Figure 1) were found to be minima on the PES of PH₄²⁺ at the MP2/6-31G** level as indicated by frequency calculations

TABLE 3: Theoretical and Experimental IonizationEnergies in eV^a

	theor IE _a	exptl ^b	
$\mathrm{NH_4}^+$	24.0	24.5	
$\mathrm{PH_4^+}$	20.5		
PH_{4}^{2+}	26.1		
AsH_4^+	19.1 ^c		
AsH_4^{2+}	24.9^{c}		

 a At the CCSD(T)/cc-pVTZ//QCISD(T)/6-311G** + ZPE level. b Taken from ref 6. c QCISD(T)/6-311G**//QCISD(T)/6-311G** + ZPE level.

(NIMAG = 0) at the same level. The structure **2** is 9.0 kcal/ mol less stable than **3** at the MP2/6-31G** level (Table 1). The difference becomes 9.5 kcal/mol at the higher QCISD (T)/6-311G** level. At the even higher level of CCSD(T)/cc-pVTZ// QCISD (T)/6-311G** the difference decreased to 8.2 kcal/mol. Including zero-point vibrational energies, i.e., at the CCSD(T)/ cc-pVTZ//QCISD (T)/6-311G** + ZPE level structure **2** is still significantly less stable than **3** by 6.5 kcal/mol. Thus, structure **3** is the global minimum on the PES of PH₄²⁺. Previously Pope et al.⁵ calculated PH₄²⁺ at the ab initio HF/TZP and CASSCF/ TZP levels and concluded,^{5b} in contrast to our present results, that the global minimum for PH₄²⁺ is structure **2**. The reported^{5b} structure of **2** at the CASSCF/TZP level agrees very well with our QCISD (T)/6-311G** calculated structure (Figure 1).

Structure **3** resembles a complex between PH_2^{2+} and a hydrogen molecule resulting in the formation of a 2e-3c bond. The sp³-hybridized phosphorus atom of **3** possesses a formal sp³-orbital (containing a single electron) oriented pseudotetrahedrally. The electron deficient P–H bond distances in the 2e-3c bond of **3** are 1.672 and 1.635 Å at the MP2/6-31G** level. These are expectedly longer than that of 2e-2c P–H bonds (1.416 Å). The H–H distance in the 2e-3c interactions of 0.848 Å is only slightly longer than H₂ (0.734 Å). Optimizations of structures **3** at the QCISD(T)/6-311G** level changed the geometries a little. The P–H and H–H bonds become slightly longer.

Transition structure, **4** (Figure 1), for the interconversion of **2** and **3**, was also located. Structure **4** lies only 1.5 and 0.7 kcal/mol, at MP2/6-31G** and QCISD(T)/6-311G**, respectively, higher in energy than structure **2**. At the highest level of theory (CCSD(T)/cc-pVTZ//QCISD(T)/6-311G** + ZPE) the energy difference between **3** and **4** disappeared. This shows that **2** if formed will spontaneously convert into **3**. We also have located transition structure **5** (Figure 1) for the deprotonation process in **2**. Structure **5** lies 18.0 kcal/mol higher in energy than **2**. Thus **2** has a considerable kinetic barrier for deprotonation, although the deprotonation process is exothermic by 67.2 kcal/mol. In comparison, the corresponding values for **1** are 6.6 and 117.7 kcal/mol. Deprotonation of **3** is slightly less exothermic by 60.7 kcal/mol.



Figure 2. MP2/6-31G** (QCISD(T)/6-311G**) optimized structures of **7**-10.

PH4³⁺. Removing an electron from PH4²⁺ dication leads to the PH4³⁺ trication. The PH4³⁺ trication is isoelectronic with the SiH4²⁺ dication. Similar to SiH4^{2+,11} the planar C_{2v} structure **6** is found to be the only minimum on the potential energy surface of PH4³⁺ at the MP2/6-31G** level (Figure 1). The planar D_{4h} symmetrical structure of PH4³⁺ was characterized as the saddle point, as there are two imaginary frequencies (i.e., NIMAG = 2) in its calculated IR spectrum. Structure **6** is characterized with a 3c-2e bond and an empty p-orbital orthogonal to the plane of the molecule.

The transition state for deprotonation of **6** into PH_3^{2+} and H^+ was also located. The calculated barrier for proton loss is only 4.5 kcal/mol and the deprotonation process is highly exothermic by 243.3 kcal/mol. This shows that the trication **6** if formed will easily dissociate into PH_3^{2+} and H^+ .

The adiabatic ionization energies (IE_a) of PH_4^+ and PH_4^{2+} were calculated. The calculated IE_as of PH_4^+ and PH_4^{2+} are 20.5 and 26.1 eV, respectively.

AsH₅²⁺. Similar to PH₄²⁺, the C_{3v} structure **7** and the C_s structure **8** are the minima on the PES of AsH₄²⁺ at the MP2/ 6-31G** level (Figure 2). The structure **8**, with a 3c-2e bond, is lower in energy than **7** by 14.8 kcal/mol at the QCISD(T)/ 6-311G**//QCISD(T)/6-311G** + ZPE level (Table 1). The As-H bond distances in the 2e-3c bond of **8** are 1.867 and 1.819 Å, significantly longer than the 2e-2c As-H bond of 1.508 Å at the MP2/6-31G** level. The H-H distance in the 2e-3c interaction is 0.821 Å at the same level. Conversion of **7** into **8** through transition structure **9** would be very facile as the barrier for the process was calculated to be only 0.4 kcal/mol. Dissociation of **8** into AsH₃⁺ and H⁺ is exothermic by only 41.3 kcal/mol (Table 2). However, no transition structure for the deprotonation of either **7** or **8** could be located.

As H_4^{3+} . The As H_4^{3+} trication can be formed by removing an electron from the As H_4^{2+} dication. Similar to P H_4^{3+} , the planar C_{2v} structure **10**, with a 2e-3c interaction, is the only minimum on the potential energy surface of As H_4^{3+} at the MP2/ 6-31G** level. The D_{4h} symmetrical structure of As H_4^{3+} is not a minimum at the MP2/6-31G* level and contains two imaginary frequencies in its calculated vibrational frequencies. Calculated structural parameters are given in Figure 2. Calculated exothermicity of the dissociation of **10** into As H_3^{2+} and H⁺ was found to be 217.1 kcal/mol (Table 2).

As expected, in the series NH₄²⁺, PH₄²⁺, and AsH₄²⁺, the calculated ΔH_0 s of deprotonation of the dications indicate an increase in the stability of the dications toward deprotonation with the increase in the size of the central atoms. Similarly, in PH₄³⁺ and AsH₄³⁺, the stability of the trications toward deprotonation also increases with the increase in the size of the

central atoms, although they are still thermodynamically and kinetically extremely unstable. However, better stabilization of some of these polycations by Schmidbaur type auration¹² with $(C_6H_5)_3PAu$, an isolobal analogue of H⁺, should be possible. In fact, Zeller and Schmidbaur have succeded in the preparation and identification of the hexacoordinate tripositively charged octahedral { $[(C_6H_5)_3PAu]_6P$ }³⁺ complex in solution,¹³ which is the isolobal analogue of PH₆³⁺.

Conclusions

Contrary to previous theoretical studies at the HF/TZP and CASCF/TZP levels,^{5b} present ab initio study at the MP2/6-31G** and QCISD(T)/6-311G** levels indicates that the global minimum structure of PH₄²⁺ is not of C_{3v} symmetric **2** but a C_s symmetrical **3** with a 3c-2e bond. The C_{3v} symmetric **2**, although a minimum on the PES, is 6.5 kcal/mol less stable than **3**. Energy calculations also indicate that conversion of **2** into **3** through transition state **4** is extremely facile. In addition the planar C_{2v} symmetric **6**, with a 3c-2e bond, was also found to be the only minimum for PH₄³⁺. Similar to phosphorus systems, C_s **8** and C_{2v} **10**, each containing a 2e-3c bond, were found to be the global minimum of AsH₄²⁺ and AsH₄³⁺, respectively. Thermodynamics of the deprotonation process of the di- and trications were also computed.

Acknowledgment. Support of our work by the National Science Foundation is gratefully acknowledged.

References and Notes

(1) Chemistry in Superacids 37. Part 36, Olah, G. A.; Rasul, G.; Burrichter, A.; Prakash, G. K. S. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* **1998**, *95*, 4099.

(2) (a) Koch, W.; Schwarz, H. In *Structure/Reactivity and Thermochemistry of Ions*; Ausloos, P., Lias, S. G., Eds.; Reidel: Dordrecht, 1987. Lammertsma, K.; Schleyer, P. v. R.; Schwarz, H. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed. Engl.* **1989**, *28*, 1321. Lammertsma, K. *Rev. Chem. Intermed.* **1988**, *9*, 141.
(b) Olah, G. A. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed. Engl.* **1993**, *32*, 767.

(3) (a) Rasul, G.; Prakash, G. K. S.; Olah, G. A. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 1997, 94, 11159. (b) Olah, G. A.; Klopman, G. Chem. Phys. Lett. 1971, 11, 604. (c) Ericsson, L. A.; Lunell, S.; Boyd, R. J. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 1993, 115, 6896 and references therein.

(4) Koch, W.; Schwarz, H. Int. J. Mass Spectrom. Ion Processes 1986, 68, 49.

(5) (a) Pope, S. A.; Hillier, I. H.; Guest, M. F.; Kendric, J. Chem. Phys. Lett. **1983**, 95, 247. (b) Pope, S. A.; Hillier, I. H.; Guest, M. F.; Kendric, J. Faraday Symp. Chem. Soc. **1984**, 19, 109.

(6) Proctor, C. J.; Porter, C. J.; Ast, T.; Bolton, P. D.; Beynon, J. H. Org. Mass Spectrom. 1981, 16, 454.

(7) Hehre, W. J.; Radom, L.; Schleyer, P. v. R.; Pople, J. A. *Ab Initio Molecular Orbital Theory*; Wiley-Interscience: New York, 1986.

(8) Dunning, T. H. J. Chem. Phys. 1989, 90, 1007.

(9) Gaussian 94 (Revision A.1). Frisch, M. J.; Trucks, G. W.; Schlegel, H. B.; Gill, P. M. W.; Johnson, B. G.; Robb, M. A.; Cheeseman, J. R.; Keith, T. A.; Peterson, G. A.; Montgomery, J. A.; Raghavachari, K.; Al-Laham, M. A.; Zakrzewski, V. G.; Ortiz, J. V.; Foresman, J. B.; Cioslowski, J.; Stefanov, B. B.; Nanayakkara, A.; Challacombe, M.; Peng, C. Y.; Ayala, P. Y.; Chen, W.; Wong, M. W.; Andres, J. L.; Replogle, E. S.; Gomperts, R; Martin, R. L.; Fox, D. J.; Binkley, J. S.; Defrees, D. J.; Baker, J.; Stewart, J. J. P.; Head-Gordon, M.; Gonzalez, C.; Pople, J. A. Gaussian, Inc.: Pittsburgh, PA, 1995.

 (10) SPARTAN, Version 4.1.1. Wavefunction Inc.: Irvine, CA, 1995.
 (11) Koch, W.; Frenking, G.; Schwarz, H.; Maquin, F.; Stahl, D. Int. J. Chem. Soc. Perkin Trans. 2 1986, 757.

(12) Schmidbaur, H. Chem. Soc. Rev. 1995, 24, 391.

(13) Zeller, E.; Schmidbaur, H. J. Chem. Soc., Chem. Commun. 1993, 69.